

THE BATTLE OF THE BRITISH:

A HISTORICAL ANALYSIS OF THE KEY INDIVIDUALS IN THE EARLY FORMATION AND ACTIVITIES OF THE TRANSVAAL SOCIETY OF ACCOUNTANTS. Ca 1904-1920.

KRISTEN VAN LELYVELD

DEPARTMENT OF ACCOUNTANCY

UNIVERSITY OF JOHANNESBURG

ABSTRACT

In the context of growing literature on Empire and Accounting (Poullaos and Sian, 2010), attention is drawn to the professional organisations leading up to and including incorporation from the 1850's in the UK and their relationship with similar organisations in the Empire, colonies and later dominions. These organisations attempted to protect professional interests in the UK by means of qualifications, designations and admission policies. Colonial or later dominion resistance against UK exclusivity and professional closure strategies met these developments. Resultant tensions affected the access of local professionals to the 'societies of privilege'. Whereas professions attempted to institute 'self-control', an inability to find agreement amongst different accounting organisations led to state intervention. This paper explores the personalities of the people who were instrumental in the establishment of the Transvaal Society of Accountants, incorporated in Transvaal Colony. One leading individual was Howard Pim. He and fellow Britons played an important role to establish independent accounting societies in the colonies and to terminate Imperial intervention within the profession. The identity of leading individuals left a distinct impact on the nature of professional organisation and closure in South Africa.

Introduction

Unlike older professions, Accountancy as an “art has evolved into a profession as a result of economic forces emanating largely in the market place”.¹ As in Britain with the Industrial Revolution, the expansion of the demand for accountancy in the *Zuid-Afrikaansche Republiek (ZAR)* was stimulated by economic growth. It was the discovery of gold that brought capital and big foreign companies to the ZAR, as well as the intensification of economic activities and British investment. Accountants were soon in demand for their ability to contribute to good business practice. The establishment of the Transvaal Society of Accountants (TSA) did not develop in isolation and so it is necessary to “describe not only the growth of professional societies and the ascension of the art as a tool of economic prosperity, but also the economic and social context in which the developments have taken place”.² To comprehend the rationale for the formation of a professional society, it is important to consider the leading individuals and their activities during the formative years of the formation of the Transvaal Society of Accountants.

The individuals who formed the TSA displayed the characteristics of leaders, businessmen and engaged citizens as accountants, which distinguished them from other professions in the colony. Many came from Britain where they received their education and training as accountants during the establishment of the profession during the mid to latter years of the nineteenth century. As a more recent addition to the organised professions, accountants were considered to be “ ‘ a class of half-professional’ persons of limited respectability”³ by the more established professions e.g. law. Lee has demonstrated that, “...the early Scottish chartered accountancy bodies did not maintain their social status in terms of the economic class origins of their general memberships. Instead, they coped with the economics of a growing market for their services by increasingly recruiting men from lower middle class and working class backgrounds while maintaining their social respectability as a professional grouping with leaderships almost exclusively of upper class and middle class origins”.⁴ It was the expansion of intellectualism in Scotland “which grew in an organic form from the contemporary liberty of free inquiry”.⁵ It was this modern inquisitive approach of various factors, including the comparative “newness” of accountancy as an organised profession, [which] simultaneously boost the probability for ‘upward social mobility’⁶. During this

¹ N.A.H. Stacey. (1954), “English Accountancy” p1

² Ibid

³ S.P. Walker, (2002), “‘Men of small standing’? Locating accountants in English society during the mid-nineteenth century” in *The European Accounting Review*, 11 (2), p378.

⁴ TA. Lee (2004). “Economic class, social status and early Scottish chartered accountants” in *Accounting Historians Journal*, 31 (2), p27.

⁵ N.A.H. Stacey (1954): “English Accountancy , p 13

⁶ Lee (2004), p27.

period, it was perceived that one's education as much as the economic state of affairs was fundamental to individuals ascending the social ladder.⁷

In order to investigate the professionalisation process of accounting in the Transvaal Colony, the personalities and characters of the individuals identified as the founders of the societies need to be explored. For this reason, the paper investigates the following questions who were the men who made the TSA? How did they position themselves as professionals in the Transvaal Colony as opposed to the profession in Britain? This paper explores the continuity of professional activities of accountants from Britain into the Colony, but also reflects on the gradual emergence of distinctive conduct and identity of accountants' within the Colony. The 'Battle of the British' points to the gradual emergence of an accounting identity in the Transvaal Colony as distinct from and contesting the accounting organisations in Britain.

⁷ *ibid*, p.32

General Characteristics of Accountants in Britain

The Scottish were the pioneers of the profession on the British Isles and home to the first Chartered Accountants.⁸ The “founders of the Scottish bodies were elite accountants with close links to the legal profession and the higher strata of Scottish society”. There was a clear association between “economic class and social status, collective mobility and market control, and social closure and professional closure”.⁹ The first organisation to be incorporated was the Institute of Accountants and Actuaries in Glasgow in 1855. The Royal Charter allowed the Institute to formulate byelaws, rules and regulations but also to appoint office administrators and to appoint an examination committee. Accountants could only gain membership through an examination, five years practical experience in an accountant’s office and the attendance of law classes at a University.¹⁰ Three examinations were written covering “general subjects, intermediate and advanced mathematics and profession knowledge, and the financial actuarial science, political economy and four papers on the general business of an accountant, under which were included book-keeping and all forms of account, auditing, bankruptcy, factorships, apportionments, administration and liquidation of companies and judicial and private references, remits and proofs.”¹¹

In England, the first organisations to be established were incorporated in 1870 under the single banner of the Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales in 1880. The process to obtain admission as a member of the Institute was remarkably similar to that of the Scottish requirements. The preliminary examinations assessed general education. The intermediate examinations focussed on bookkeeping and accounts as well as auditing and liquidation, while the final examination touched on arbitration law and mercantile law along with company and bankruptcy law. These exams were spread over a five-year period of compulsory articles in an existing, recognised accounting firm.¹² The difference in the qualification for membership in Scotland lay with the English not making attendance of law classes compulsory, which affected their social status since “...compulsory attendance at university was the result of enlightened professional education stemming from social causes which at once placed accountancy in Scotland on a different level from what the organised profession secured for itself in England.”¹³ The social class structure in England was determined by material wealth where the more affluent population scorned the “market-place of commerce and industry.”¹⁴ With the industrial revolution, increasing wealth began to infiltrate the lower social orders and an entrepreneurial class developed from the

⁸ R. Brown (1968), *A history of Accounting and Accountants*. p181

⁹ C. Poullaos (2009) “Professionalization” in JR Edwards and SP Walker (Eds), *The Routledge Companion to Accounting History*, p251

¹⁰ *Ibid*, p210.

¹¹ AH. Stacey (1954); *English Accountancy: A Study in social and economic history, 1800-1954*, p21

¹² Stacey, p25 & Brown, p236

¹³ *Ibid*

¹⁴ Stacey, p12

'nonconformists'. This revolutionary group opened schools called 'academies' which imparted knowledge to its students on the exploitation of the economic opportunities.¹⁵

Escalation in industrial and individual opulence meant that as "civil society was becoming more complex, the number of social roles which each individual fulfilled increased in variety and number... [and] the creation of voluntary associations was one major response."¹⁶ Associations encouraged "in their member habits of cooperation, solidarity and public spiritedness...Participation in civic organisations inculcates skill of cooperation as well as a sense of shared responsibility for collective endeavours."¹⁷ The membership of associations critically depicts the desire for a sense of "structure and the discipline of rules".¹⁸ This mindset in turn stimulated the infiltration of organisation and regulation within occupation and societal pursuits. This is portrayed in some references of leading accountants in England and Scotland.

The early accountants from Britain can be traced back to 1645 when George Watson, born in Edinburgh into a merchant family renowned for being "merchants of good account and substance."¹⁹ His comprehensive education in "improving merchandising and learning book-keeping"²⁰ in Scotland and abroad, equipped him with a solid foundation to serve as accountant to the Bank of Scotland, Treasurer for the Merchant Maiden Hospital and for the Society for the propagation of Christian knowledge in Scotland, while sustaining his own successful business in factories and bills of exchange. The testimonials from these corporations state that he "acquitted himself with a great deal of integrity, faithfulness and diligence."²¹ Alexander Chalmers was another remarkable man. As accountant, Accountant-General for the Board of Excise, Accountant to the City of Edinburgh as well as preparing the Table of Interest and constructed a plan for the keeping of the books for the Church of Scotland's Fund for the Widows and Orphans, he demonstrated that he too possessed good business ethics and associated with the high standards of Accountants.²²

James Balfour was the Scottish accountant with a remarkable character, an "amiable, upright, and able man; so clever in business matters that he could do in one hour as another man in three. He was always eager to quench and arrest litigation rather than to promote it, and

¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ R.J. Morris (1990); "Clubs, societies and associations" in F.M.L Thompson (Ed): The Cambridge Social History of Britain 1750-1950 Vol. 3: Social Agencies and Institutions; Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, p 395

¹⁷ R.D. Putnam (1993); "Making Democracy Work: Civic traditions in modern Italy"; Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press. Cited in D. Stolle (1998), *Bowling Together, Bowling Alone: "The development of voluntary trust in voluntary associations"*, in Political Psychology, Vol. 19 No. 3 1998, p2.

¹⁸ Morris, 396

¹⁹ Brown, p 183

²⁰ Ibid

²¹ Brown, p 184

²² Ibid p186

consequently enjoyed so much esteemed, professionally, that he could get business whenever he chose to undertake it.”²³ As Secretary and Treasurer to the Honourable Company of Edinburgh Golfers, Jamie’s²⁴ portrait was commissioned by the Club for this distinguished member and after his death in 1795, the Club held a Dinner in “...memory of their last worthy Secretary” and toasts were dedicated “...to the Memory of our Worthy and late departed Friend, Mr. James Balfour, whose benevolent and cheery dispositions, and happy social powers, while they captivated all, particularly endeared to him to his numerous friends.”²⁵ Balfour’s profile was characteristic of the nature of many accountants in the civil environment.

Mr James Ewing of Glasgow founded James Ewing & Co., which still exists today. His interests however, were not restricted to Accountancy but also included politics as he also took office as Lord Provost, Lord Dean of Guild and was the first Member of Parliament for the city under the Reform Bill of 1832.²⁶

These extracts on early accountants’ conduct and social standing, and Brown’s more detailed discussion on the early accountants confirms that the early accountants were involved in activities outside of their accounting trade indicating their social standing, interests, benevolence and political awareness. There appear to be a number of personal attributes that emerge from this brief discussion of the accounting professions’ founding fathers. These individuals were born into upstanding families of “good account and substance”²⁷ seemingly of the middle and upper working class of the Scottish social strata, there appeared to be a distinct Christian foundation as the individuals contributed to the functioning of Church and other welfare organisations. Their family financial state of affairs afforded them the luxury of a solid educational foundation, allowing them to further themselves economically and in their social standing by taking on the managerial role in their own accounting firms. Being personalities of substance, they engaged themselves directly or indirectly in the political affairs of the societies, in which they lived. True to their diverse interests and skills, these men involved themselves in a variety of cultural, social and sporting clubs, satisfying their need to connect with like-minded individuals. Finally as respected individuals, their contribution to their societies received recognition in the awarding the Justice of Peace or Officer of the Empire. From these eight personal attributes identified, a matrix of characteristics set these individuals apart as leading men in the accounting profession. The question now is, were these characteristics visible amongst the leadership of the profession in the Transvaal?

²³ Ibid p 188

²⁴ James Balfour was called Jamie by friends and family.

²⁵ Cited in Brown pp 191-193

²⁶ Brown, p 199

²⁷ Ibid, p183

Accountants from Britain were the carriers of the accounting organisation tradition across the Empire. The two leading accounting organisations that originated in Britain were instrumental in generating accounting professionalisation in South Africa. The ICAEW limited its membership explicitly to public accountants,²⁸ which closed the profession to other accounting types, and as a result, new competitive associations formed. The first and most relevant of these associations was the Society of Accountants and Auditors, who offered fewer restrictions to its members, by opening its doors to those accountants who could not gain entrance to the Institute or not willing to pay the fees of ‘qualified’ accountants. The Institute’s Charter also limited membership by only allowing articles to be served to those living in England and only British residents could become fellows. This saw the battle begin as the Society aimed not only at those excluded from the Institute in Britain but also offered association for those in the Commonwealth.²⁹ The continued commitment to their overseas policy saw the Society open branches in the Commonwealth and of specific interest, was the Transvaal Branch.³⁰ The Society changed its rules to allow for local articulated clerks in the Transvaal to commence with their learning contracts. The Society ensured the maintenance of the high standard of the accountants’ education in Britain through their “exporting” of accounting qualifications in opening up examination centres in the Commonwealth.³¹ These developments prepared the table for the future battle that lay between the bodies within the developing profession

²⁸ T.J. Johnson and M. Caygill (1971), “The Development of Accountancy Links in the Commonwealth” in *Accounting and Business Research, Spring*, p 157

²⁹ Ibid

³⁰ Ibid, p 161

³¹ Ibid, p163

The Founding Members the Transvaal Society of Accountants

The gold discoveries created an economic boom on the Witwatersrand in the Transvaal Republic. The arrival of investors and prospectors from around the World necessitated the services of accountants to manage the finances of firms and to facilitate good business practices. “British accounting associations’ trained colonial accountants both in Britain and in the colonies, as well as inspiring the formation of similar-but-different versions of themselves by colonial accountants (aided and abetted, at times by British immigrant accountants). The British professional organisation served as a blueprint for such organisations in the colonies,³² through the British accountants who were eager to imitate their British “status and modus operandi.”³³

In the midst of political instability in the ZAR those with “vested interests in securing an environment conducive to economic and business development and political activities, accountants as stakeholders in the ZAR economy, embarked on strategies to organise themselves as a profession.”³⁴ As members of British professional organisations, sixty-five accountants formed the Institute of Accountants and Auditors in the South African Republic (referred to as the Institute from now on) in 1894.³⁵ The organisation aimed at “...the elevation of the Profession of Public Accountants as a whole and the promotion of their efficiency and usefulness by compelling the observance of strict rules of conduct as a condition of membership, and by setting up a high standard and general education and knowledge”.³⁶ A year later, the Society of Incorporated Accountants and Auditors established a South African branch. The Society’s main purpose was to keep the interests of its members in mind, and to assist in registering new members.³⁷ The members of the Institute were looking towards the Transvaal Government to grant them incorporation early on in their existence and by May 1899, the Council announced at their Annual General Meeting that the Government had published a draft law, which was to go before the Volksraad at the session at that time.³⁸

³² S. Sian and C. Poullaos (2010), “Setting the Stage” in *Accountancy and Empire: The British Legacy of professional Organisation*, C. Poullaos and S. Sian (Eds), Routledge: New York, p3

³³ Ibid.

³⁴ G. Verhoef and L van Vuuren (2010), *The Year the Century Ended: The genesis of the Transvaal Society of Accountants*, Unpublished paper presented at the Economic Society of South Africa Conference in September 2009, p 9

³⁵ Ibid,

³⁶ Articles of Association and By-Laws of the Institute of Accountants and Auditors in the South African Republic. 1894, Burmester & Co Printers: Johannesburg, p. 5

³⁷ G.E. Noyce: “The History of the Profession in South Africa” in *Die Suid-Afrikaanse Rekenmeester*, March 1954, p5

³⁸ IAASA Annual Report 30 April 1899, p5

The outbreak of the Boer War halted any advancement towards incorporation and it was only again in 1902 at the first Annual General Meeting after the War that the bid for incorporation under the new government was launched. In order to consolidate the position of the IAASA it entered into an agreement with an “English Society of reorganised standing”³⁹ whereby the Institute became the Transvaal Branch of the Society of Incorporated Accountants and Auditors (England).⁴⁰

The battle within the British profession, as mentioned earlier, was extended to the Transvaal, where the SAA’s Transvaal Branch supported the desire for incorporation and successfully proposed a bill excluding non-residential practitioners.⁴¹ In a letter to Sir Richard Solomon, Attorney-General of the Transvaal, JH Pim explains that “...we accountants have always felt the absence of Government recognition, as very detrimental to the standing and influence of our profession, and in the old county [Great Britain] many efforts have been made to constitute practising Accountants into a close profession, under some distinctive name, which would mark off its members from the casual and unqualified practitioners.”⁴² The profession did not want state intervention in the organisational matters of the accountancy profession, but statutory recognition of the professions’ right to regulate itself. Self-regulation was widely acknowledged as the prerogative of any profession.

Despite the opposition of the English Institute and other bodies’ to the legislation, it was approved. Ordinance No 3 (Private) 1904 provided for the registration of Accountants in the Transvaal under the name of “The Transvaal Society of Accountants”,⁴³ the development reflecting the underlying British organisation principles. Originating predominantly from Britain, the founding fathers of the Transvaal Society of Accountants (TSA) derive from an assiduous generation. “British trained (and born) accountants travelled throughout the British Empire, exporting their skilled labour, their mode of labour organisation, symbolic capital and occupational norms. In particular, the institutional form of British accounting associations that emerged in Scotland in the 1850s, England in the 1870s and Ireland in the 1880s diffused to the colonies in the last twenty years of the nineteenth century”.⁴⁴ As in the British case, where the need to form professional bodies to organise and regulate the growing number and need of accountants in the increasingly lucrative British economy with the Industrial Revolution, the accountants in the ZAR were encouraged to follow those that had led the professionalization process in Britain. The British blueprint was pursued with great

³⁹ IAASA Annual Report 30 April 1902, p11

⁴⁰ Deed of Agreement: The Society of Accountants and Auditors and the Institute of Accountants and Auditors in the South African Republic: Johannesburg 1902

⁴¹ Johnson & Caygill, p169

⁴² NASA, LD 528 AG4042/3. Letter from J.H. Pim to Sir Richard Solomon, 27 November 1903.

⁴³ Ordinances of the Transvaal, Part II [Nos 18 to 50 and I to V (Private)] 1904, Ordinance No 3 of 1904 (Private), p. xi

⁴⁴ WF Chua and C. Poullaos (2002): “The empire Strikes Back? An exploration of centre-periphery interaction between the ICAEW and accounting associations in the self-governing colonies of Australia, Canada and South Africa, 1880-1907” in Accounting, Organizations and Society, Vol. 27, p411.

conviction by the accountants in the ZAR who had been trained by the pioneers of the profession. The first council of the TSA consisted of members who were previously members of the Institute, and later of the Transvaal Branch of the Society. They had had lobbied for their incorporation in the Transvaal and once obtained, had achieved their independence from the parent British bodies.

There were a significant number of accountants who contributed to the bid for incorporation by sitting on the councils of the Institute, Transvaal Branch of the Society or of the TSA. It was CL Andersson, J. Blinkhorn, FWR Bompas, WH Dawe, J. Douglas, F. Diamond EC Jamiesson, D. Henderson, HJ Macrae, J. Moon, J.P. O'Reilly, T. Pryce, and J. Peirson who served on the council of the Institute and the Transvaal Branch of the Society. Two key individuals who served on all three preceding accounting organisations' councils in the ZAR were Alexander Aiken and Frank Raleigh. Another five members of the council were also on the first council of the Institute in 1894 and then on the TSA council. These were Robert Baikie John Dougall, Fredrick R. Lynch, Charles Stuart and Samuel Thomson. The newcomers to the TSA council were James Howard Pim, John Carter, John Boyd, John Muir and Thomas Watson.⁴⁵ The presidents of the first twenty years of the TSA were JH Pim, S. Thomson, A. Aiken, C. Stuart, A.E.A. Williamson, J.G. Carter, P. Whitely, S.C. Caruthers, A.N. Smith, E.H. Dankwerts, H.J. Macrae, J.T. Goldsbury and H.G.L. Panchaud.⁴⁶ The accountants who will be discussed here, were either on the Provisional Council of the TSA or a President of the Society between 1904 and 1920.

How did the leading figures of the early TSA compare with the profile of the early English or Scottish accountants. Who were they and how did they engage with general society? The first prominent accountant was James Howard Pim. Pim was not only recognised as “a very astute businessperson, entrepreneur and brilliant accountant,”⁴⁷ in his role in the development of the Accounting profession in South Africa, but also for his contribution in political and current affairs of the early Johannesburg, Transvaal and the Union of South Africa. He was born in Greythorn, Kingston, in Dublin County in Ireland on 27 September 1862, to Irish merchant⁴⁸ James Pim and his wife Elizabeth F. Evans.⁴⁹ Howard Pim and his ten siblings⁵⁰ were raised in a Quaker household⁵¹ and were educated at private schools. Pim obtained a Masters of Art at Trinity College in Dublin and for that reason was given exemption from the Preliminary

⁴⁵ Details of members of councils found in the Articles of Association and By-Laws of the Institute of Accountants and Auditors in the South African Republic, 1894;1898; 1899 and 1902; and in various documents pertaining to the Incorporation of the TSA.

⁴⁶ Transvaal Society of Accountants Register of Members 1904 - 1905; MJJ van Rensburg, (1990) Presidents I have known – Some aspects of the history of the Transvaal Society of Chartered Accountants, p iv.

⁴⁷ Deloitte Southern Africa entitled “Of Ledgers and Legends – The Story of Deloitte Southern Africa”, July 2006, p 132

⁴⁸ A. Cunningham, Howard Pim; PWHT, p1

⁴⁹ NASA, MGH 84939; A. Cunningham, WITS Historical Papers, Pim Collection

⁵⁰ A. Cunningham, WITS Historical Papers, Pim Collection

⁵¹ A. Cunningham, Howard Pim; PWHT, p1

Examination by the Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales in January of 1886.⁵² In 1890, Pim arrived in Kimberley, South Africa, in the employment of Cecil John Rhodes as auditor of the British South Africa Company.⁵³ It was then in 1894, that Pim set up an accounting office in Johannesburg and in Kimberly with Thomas Douglas, which went insolvent during the Boer War⁵⁴. In 1898, he married Rosamund Undecima Bere from Devon, England, with whom he had three children; James Montague Pim (named after both grandfathers⁵⁵); Hildah Cecil Mary Pim and Margaret Joane Coydane Pim.⁵⁶ Maintaining his household, business and character according to Quaker philosophy, Pim was associated with benevolence and shrewd business practices, which saw him involved in a wide variety of activities politically, professionally, and within the early Johannesburg society.⁵⁷ Holding membership at the Dublin University Club, Civil Service Club in Cape Town, the Kimberly Club and the Rand Club in Johannesburg demonstrates Pim's further commitment to the society in which he lived.⁵⁸

Howard Pim's philanthropy was demonstrated by his apparent moral obligation towards welfare for all, regardless of race or creed. This principle saw him sympathetic to any group of individuals treated with disregard. This included the "Uitlanders"⁵⁹ in the ZAR where he joined the "armed demonstration" of the Jameson Raid.⁶⁰ He served as a lieutenant, captain and commander during the siege of Kimberley where he was responsible for part of the town's defences; he continued this fight for independence and recognition when he voluntarily enlisted as a private in the Rand Rifles in Johannesburg refusing to be an officer.⁶¹ Despite his support for the "Uitlanders", Pim was a fair man and he "...would not have been unsparing of his opinions on the way the defeated Afrikaners were treated".⁶² He freely voiced his disdain towards the poor treatment individuals and groups of marginalised people

⁵² W.J. de Kock (1968) *Dictionary of South African Biography*, National Council of Social Research, p621; A. Cunningham; Wits Historical Papers, Pim Collection p v.

⁵³ A. Cunningham, WITS Historical Papers; Pim Collection , p v.

⁵⁴ NASA, WLD 5/16 286/1903, Death Certificate; A. Cunningham; Howard Pim; PWHT, p 2

⁵⁵ A. Cunningham; WITS Historical Papers Pim; Collection

⁵⁶ NASA, MGH 84939

⁵⁷ Apparent in 1976 by Anna Cunningham in the Historical Papers of the William Cullen Library at the University of the Witwatersrand and in the pamphlet written by her for the Parktown and Westcliff Heritage Trust; in a research project in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Masters of Education by Debra Jane Burnett on "J. Howards Pim (1862-1934): An Examination of his Liberal Philosophy and Educational Activities" in 1990; and in two commemorative non-academic works of "Presidents I have Known: Some Aspects of the History of the Transvaal Society of Chartered Accountants" by MJJ van Rensburg; in the South African Chartered Accountant Journal in February 1965; in the Dictionary of Southern Africa Biography, National Council of Social Research in 1968 ; in the South African Who's Who in the years 1907-1934 as well as in the commemorative book by Deloitte Southern Africa entitled "Of Ledgers and Legends – The Story of Deloitte Southern Africa", July 2006.

⁵⁸ Who's Who 1908-1934

⁵⁹ Meaning foreigners

⁶⁰ A. Cunningham; Howard Pim; PWHT, p 2

⁶¹ Ibid

⁶² Deloitt SA, p 133

including on Native issues and Chinese indentured labour, which saw him fall out of favour within certain political spheres and mining firms.⁶³

Renowned for his ethical nature, Lord Milner corresponded with Pim at the end of January 1903 enquiring whether he would be willing to stand for election to the first Johannesburg Town Council.⁶⁴ Pim, was elected as the Chairman of the finance committee responsible for the raising of the first municipal loans and later in November 1904 Pim became Deputy Mayor of the city. Pim contributed significantly to the establishment of the cultural amenities of Johannesburg, including the public library and the art gallery to which he left significant art works in his will.⁶⁵ Serving on the City Council, Pim contributed to the establishment of the Joint Council, which aimed to improve the circumstances of all races.⁶⁶ Pim's stance on the marginalised people of colour was not always popular. Pim felt his integrity was personally attacked when the many mining houses refused to re-elect him as auditor of their accounts directly resulting from his stance on Chinese labour on the mines. The term "Pimmed" originated from "the loss of emoluments for reasons of principle".⁶⁷ Soon this matter came to pass and Pim remained involved in politics and other current affairs right up until his death in 1934, serving on a variety of commissions, boards and acting as an advisor on a great variety of issues.

Pim's involvement in politics and current affairs however, was only a secondary occupation to his accounting firm, Howard Pim and Hardy, which he and John Lawton Hardy established in 1909 after having worked together since 1905. Later the firm was succeeded by Pim, Whitely, Close, then Pim and Goldby, and later merged with other prominent accounting firms to become Deloitte Southern Africa, as it is known today.⁶⁸ Pim was an engaged accountant putting the issues of the day pertaining to economic development on the table in an attempt to change them. His principles were demonstrated in his commitment to the development of the Accounting profession where he was a leading figure in the bid for incorporation of accountants and served as president on the first council of the TSA in 1904 and 1905 and was re-elected in 1906 as vice-president of the society.⁶⁹

His contribution to the accounting society of South Africa has legitimated naming him a founding father of the profession in South Africa but also a champion of the early inclusive nature of the society. As Cunningham writes, Pim was a "keen horseman, golfer and naturalist, a writer of pamphlets and articles for The State, a generous philanthropist, a hard-

⁶³ A. Cunningham Howard Pim; PWHT, p2; Deloitte SA, p 133; de Kock, p 621.

⁶⁴ A. Cunningham; WITS Historical Papers, Pim Collection

⁶⁵ WITS Historical Papers, Pim Collection, Cunningham; A. Cunningham; Howard Pim; PWHT, p 5

⁶⁶ A. Cunningham; Howard Pim; PWHT, p 4

⁶⁷ Ibid, p2

⁶⁸ Ibid, p3, Deloitte SA, pp20- 40 & 135

⁶⁹ TSA Register of Members 1; p 2

headed accountant and businessman, a lover of art and literature and a passionate believer in justice, good race relations and the intrinsic worth of man.”⁷⁰ In 1919 Pim was appointed an Officer of the British Empire for which he received various letters of congratulations.⁷¹ Pim’s conduct exhibited a spirit, or a character, true of his age: Gentlemen and Imperialist.

Another remarkable contributor to development of the accounting profession was Sir Charles Llewellyn Andersson. He was born in Cape Town in 1861 to adventure seeker father Charles John Andersson who was an explorer, ornithologist, hunter and author. His father’s premature death in 1867 left his mother, Sarah Jane, to support her young family, which she did by opening a haberdashery shop and taking in sewing. Her industrious ethic influenced Llewellyn throughout his life. At fourteen years old, Andersson was forced to earn a living at an early age and joined the Cape civil service. At 26, Llewellyn moved to Johannesburg where he quickly became involved in various aspects of community life.

In the early years after arriving in Johannesburg Andersson played a leading role in the founding and running of the Wanderers Club where he also participated as a keen sportsman. Acquaintances with immigrants from Britain, Llewellyn identified with the “Uitlanders” in the ZAR, and he joined the Reform Committee and played a significant role in Jameson Raid for which he was sentenced to two year imprisonment, which was later commuted to a fine of £2 000. Accountant by profession; it was in 1897 that he formed his Accounting and Auditing firm; C.L. Andersson & Co. which consulted widely, notably for Sanlam Life Insurers in the years 1920-1921 and 1923-1927⁷². Not limited to this discipline however, Andersson was a member of the stock exchange, took part in various speculative enterprises and was a director of several companies⁷³.

It was this ability that he contributed to the profession of Accounting as a member of the Institute,⁷⁴ where he served as the Secretary⁷⁵ as well as on its council in 1902. It appears that he later was less involved, as he was no longer a member of the council. He was a regular member of the Society of Accountants & Auditors,⁷⁶ as well as a founding member of the TSA, elected a member of the council in 1907 and Vice-President in 1908.⁷⁷ It appears that

⁷⁰ A. Cunningham; Howard Pim; PWHT, p 6

⁷¹ A. Cunningham; WITS Historical Papers, Pim Collection

⁷² Sanlam Life Insurers, Annual Reports

⁷³ All information in the two paragraphs before this footnote is taken from the Sir Charles Llewellyn Andersson PWHT Pamphlet by Anna Cunningham.

⁷⁴ Institute of Accountants and Auditors in South Africa (IAASA), Articles of Association and Bye-laws of, 1894; IAASA, Annual Report and Accounts, 1899;

⁷⁵ IAASA; Annual Reports and Accounts; 1898

⁷⁶ Transvaal Branch of the SAA, Annual Report & Accounts, 1906

⁷⁷ TSA Register of Members 1, p111

“an Accountant by profession, Llewellyn was a soldier by choice”.⁷⁸ Having joined Duke of Edinburgh’s Own Volunteer Rifles and serving in the Basuto War of 1878, he was also involved in the Zulu War of 1879 and in the Boer War after which he helped organise the volunteer regiments for the South African Defence Force. During the 1922 strikes, Andersson commanded the Civic Guards, after which he was awarded his knighthood. He had previously been honoured as an Officer of the Empire.⁷⁹

Another notable contributor to the establishment of the accounting profession in South Africa was made by Alexander Aiken. He served on the councils of the Institute of Accountants and Auditors in the South African Republic⁸⁰ and the Transvaal Branch of the Society of Incorporated Accountants and Auditors (England),⁸¹ the SAA as well as on the first Council of the TSA. As a member of the council, Aiken was elected Vice-President of the TSA in 1905 and 1912, President in 1907, and sat on the council from 1904-1913.⁸² He was born in Aberdeenshire, Scotland in February 1861,⁸³ Aiken completed his education at Peterhead Academy he received his training at the Town and Country Bank in Buchan as a banker. It was because of his bad health that Aiken moved at the age of 29 to South Africa and joined the South African Loan, Mortgage and Mercantile Agency in Pretoria, then in Johannesburg and Cape Town.⁸⁴

It was in 1895 that Aiken started a private practice as a public accountant “and soon made himself prominent in his profession”.⁸⁵ He joined forces with JG Carter and formed Alex Aiken and Carter in October 1905, which merged several times and finally in 2002 became KPMG.⁸⁶ As a leading figure, Aiken did not limit his contribution to the Accounting profession; he was involved in an array of activities, including his appointment as assistant to E. Evans who was financial advisor to Lord Roberts in the military government of the Transvaal in 1900. Further evidence of his exceptionally valued expertise is his involvement in the financial aspects of the government in the Transvaal, in the capacity of town treasurer. He was appointed chairman of the Board of Arbitration, advising public bodies and corporations. He compiled the ‘Aiken Report’, which was the benchmark for municipal employment for many years. Aiken was also a member of the Provincial Finances Commission in 1922. Considered one of the ‘Gentlemen’ of Johannesburg, he was a member of the Rand Club.⁸⁷ Aiken dedicated much of his attention to education as a member of the

⁷⁸ A. Cunningham, L. Andersson, PWHT; p 3

⁷⁹ Who’s Who 1926; A. Cunningham, L. Andersson, PWHT, p3

⁸⁰ IAASAR; Annual Report and Accounts of the, 1899 & 1902

⁸¹ Transvaal Branch of the SAA, Annual Report and Accounts ; 1906

⁸² TSA Register of Members 1; p2

⁸³ NASA, MHG 2838/41

⁸⁴ W.J. de Kock (1968) p5

⁸⁵ Ibid

⁸⁶ KPMG

⁸⁷ Who’s Who 1908-1941

Council of Education from 1915 until his death. He contributed immensely to the establishment of the University of the Witwatersrand.⁸⁸

Another British gentleman who requires recognition for his contribution to the development to the Accounting profession in South Africa is Robert Baikie. Born in Orkney, Scotland in 1861,⁸⁹ to architect father Samuel Baikie, Robert Baikie was educated at the Kirkwall Grammar School⁹⁰. The school, which exists today, dates back to around 1200AD, founded as a Cathedral school by Bishop Bjarni.⁹¹ As with Andersson, Baikie was an avid sportsman, founding Pretoria Bowling club (where one of the greens still bears his name⁹²) and Thistle Association Football Club, a founding member of the Pretoria Golf Club and the Caledonian Lawn Tennis Club. In addition as a loyal Scotsman, he founded the Caledonian Society in Pretoria.⁹³ Baikie arrived in the ZAR in 1890 and resided in Pretoria, where he owned a considerable number of properties⁹⁴; including 469 Andries Street,⁹⁵ where he resided with his wife and children.⁹⁶

He held his offices at 45 Bureau Street Pretoria from where, he practiced as an agent for the Standard Life Assurance Co, Alliance Assurance Co LTD (Fire) and was Secretary of the Transvaal Permanent Building & Investment Society.⁹⁷ Despite having trained as an accountant and a member of the Scottish Institute, Fellow of the Society of Accountants and Auditors, England, and of the Chartered Institute of Secretaries as well as a General Agent, it appears, from correspondence, that he was furthermore involved with the auditing of the Transvaal Life Insurance annual financial returns⁹⁸. Baikie's commitment to accounting never faltered and he was a founding member of the IAASAR, a member of the Transvaal Branch of the Society of Accounts and Auditors as well as a member of the 1904 founding council of the TSA. Baikie's commitment to the profession in the Transvaal led to his election to the Council in the years 1905-1901; 1911-1913 and 1929-1932 and was elected Vice-President of the Society in 1909, 1930 and 1931.⁹⁹

⁸⁸ W.J. de Kock, p5 ; Who's Who 1908-1941

⁸⁹ NASA, MHG 88635

⁹⁰ Who's Who 1908-1935

⁹¹ Kirkwall Grammar School

⁹² T.E Andrews, p 102

⁹³ Who's Who 1908-1935

⁹⁴ NASA, MHG 88635

⁹⁵ T.E Andrews, p 102

⁹⁶ It is not clear how many children Baikie had as in the Who's Who makes reference to four children, however Baikie's death certificate (NASA, MHG 88635) only indicates he had three girls.

⁹⁷ NASA, ENTd F52/311

⁹⁸ Assumption made based on correspondence, obtained from NASA, ENTd F 52/311, with the Department of Finance of Pretoria in which Baikie obtains the Transvaal Insurance Returns for 1910 in which the information regarding the total new policies issued and the amount assured for 1910 as well as the total number of policies terminated, discontinued or lapsed during 1910 and the amount;

⁹⁹ TSA Register of Members 1

Another founding Council member of the TSA was John Gordon Carter who was born in 1874 in Mitcham in Surrey, England. He was educated at the historic Rugby School in England and qualified as a Chartered Accountant and member of the Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales in the 1890's. Carter came to the Transvaal in 1902 where he set up practice and later joined Alexander Aiken establishing the well known accounting firm Alex Aiken and Carter in 1905.¹⁰⁰ A sport lover, Carter was a member of the Athenaeum Club as well as the Rand Club.¹⁰¹ Carter's contribution to the TSA was invaluable as he was a member of the Provisional Council appointed under section four of the Accountants Ordinance, as had been the case with all of the founding members of the Council. His service to the TSA extended further when he was elected member of the council from 1905-1910, 1914-1917, 1918-1921 and 1923-1926. He served as President in 1910 and Vice-President in 1918.¹⁰²

The common attributes identified in these notable individuals, Howard Pim, Charles Andersson, Alex Aiken, Robert Baikie and John Carter can be summarised in the following : Most of the accountants who contributed to the initiatives to organise the accounting profession in the Transvaal were born into middle or upper working class families, Pim, Andersson, Aiken, Baikie and Carter were brought up to be leaders yet were not shy to work hard in order to maintain and improve on their circumstances. Pim, the eldest of eleven children, was exposed to proper business dealings with his father and grandfather renowned merchants in Dublin. With the premature death of his father, Andersson began fending for himself at an early age but his mother's determination equipped him with the skills necessary to make something of himself. Religion was the fundamental foundation on which Pim was raised. As a child his father ran a strict Quaker household which Pim continued with, in his own family. He was renowned for the effect that his Quaker beliefs had in his business dealings, political activities and his philanthropy.

Seemingly, education was essential to the families of the mentioned TSA leaders as they all were educated at notable institutions and received tertiary education, which was limited to the more affluent families in the societies in which they lived. It was their qualification as accountants in Britain that set them apart as individuals in the Transvaal and facilitated preservation of the British business ethics and standards. It was with this groundwork that these individuals were successful in the management roles of business in the Transvaal. Their endeavours were not limited to the accounting profession but branched out into other spheres of the economy as auditors, advisors or in the operations of the firms. Pim's partnership with John Hardy merged a number of times and was finally absorbed as part of Deloitte South Africa. Alex Aiken and John Carter joined in partnership to form their own accounting firm Alex Aiken and Carter. This firm eventually merged to become part of KPMG. Andersson

¹⁰⁰ Who's Who 1908 – 1942; KPMG

¹⁰¹ Who's Who 1908-1942

¹⁰² TSA Register of Members, p5

was a well respected auditor and serves as auditor to Sanlam Life Assurance. Baikie was an agent and financial advisor for the Standard Life Assurance Co., Alliance Assurance Co Ltd and the Transvaal Permanent Building and Investment Society. The leading agents in the early TSA were therefore responsible for the audits of respected financial services companies across the cultural and language divisions in the country.

Not limited however to business, the leaders of the profession also involved themselves in political engagements of the Transvaal. When the former ZAR declined political rights to the “Uitlanders”, they supported the “Uitlander’s” cause for recognition of full citizenship and when Britain took control after 1902, they supported the new government. Pim served in the first Town Council of Johannesburg, he served a short term as Deputy Mayor and contributed to the establishment of the Joint Council. Andersson was part of the Reform Committee and was imprisoned for his role in the Jameson Raid. He spent a significant portion of his life as a soldier, for which he eventually received his Knighthood.

As well-rounded individuals, there was a strong support for social engagement. All the accountants who contributed to the formation of the TSA, were involved in club membership of a variety of social and community engagements. Pim belonged to the Dublin Univesity Club, Civil Service Club in Cape Town, Kimberley Club and the Rand Club in Johannesburg, but contributed to the cultural amenities of the city including the public library and art gallery. Andersson was an avid sportsman and founding member of the Wanderers Club and member of the Rand Club. Aiken belonged to the Rand Club and was involved in the establishment of the University of the Witwatersrand. Robert Baikie founded the Pretoria Bowling Club, Thistle Association Football Club as well as the Caledonian Society in Pretoria and Carter belonged to the Athenaeum Club and Rand Clubs in Johannesburg.

From this discussion, it is clear why these individuals were well respected within society and received recognition for their contributions. Howard Pim was honoured as an Officer of the British Empire and Charles Andersson was knighted for his role in the 1922 Mine Workers Strike on the Witwatersrand.

A large number of equally competent and engaged accountants also joined the other founding fathers of the profession in the Transvaal. Very scant information on these individuals is limited, however the aim of the paper is to identify who were the men who made the TSA and from the limited information available, attempt to discuss how they positioned themselves as professionals in the Transvaal Colony and their professional activities.

John Dougall, born in Paisley, Scotland in 1849¹⁰³ arrived in Natal at the tender age of 21 and married Katherina Marais at 39. Dougall qualified as an accountant and served as Director of the Union Land and Agricultural Bank and as a member of the Pretoria Court. He lived and practiced in Pretoria and his firm Dougall, Lance and Webber Accountants held their office in the Tudor Chambers in Church Street.¹⁰⁴ As a responsible accountant, Dougall was a member of the Institute at its year of inception in 1894¹⁰⁵ until and 1902.¹⁰⁶ He furthered his support for the profession by becoming a member of the Transvaal Branch of the Society.¹⁰⁷ His encouragement of the move towards incorporation led him to serve as a member of the Provisional Council of the TSA in 1904.¹⁰⁸ His continued support for the profession is evident in his service on the Council of the TSA in the years 1905, 1910, 1914-17 and 1919-22. He served as Vice –President in 1906, 1915 and 1919 and as President of the TSA in 1921.¹⁰⁹ Dougall’s stature in society is evident in his membership of the New Club in Johannesburg and the Pretoria Club but especially as he was appointed the Justice of Peace and honoured as an Officer of the British Empire (OBE).¹¹⁰

Suffering from heart failure and pneumonia,¹¹¹ Frederick Richard Lynch died at the early age of fifty-eight. Born in Gosport, Hampshire, England in 1870 as the second son of Captain W.H. Lynch, Lynch was educated privately, qualifying as a Registered Public Accountant in England and worked as an Accountant and Manager of Companies in Johannesburg. An astute businessman, he managed the Anglo-Transvaal Association Ltd and was associated with the Frielander’s Companies while running his accounting firm in Yeoville, Johannesburg.¹¹² Lynch held membership at the Johannesburg Rand and Country Clubs, but failed to belong to the former accounting organisations in the Boer Republic prior to incorporation. He joined the Provisional Council in 1905 and became Vice-President in 1907 and remained a member of the Society until his death in 1929.¹¹³

Born near Glasgow in Scotland in 1873; John Hastings Muir came to Witwatersrand in 1894. He was a Registered Public Accountant and engaged himself in the shipping business in Glasgow. Once in Johannesburg, Muir was Secretary of Companies and Accountant. He was especially active in the mining industry as Secretary of the Transvaal Coal Owners Association Ltd and was associated with the Consolidated Goldfield of South Africa, Ltd and

¹⁰³ NASA, MHG 60083

¹⁰⁴ Who’s Who 1908 -1926

¹⁰⁵ IAASAR, Articles of Association & Bye-Laws, 1894.

¹⁰⁶ IAASAR, Annual Report & Accounts, 1899 & 1902

¹⁰⁷ SAA, Transvaal Branch, Annual Reports & Accounts, 1906

¹⁰⁸ TSA Register of Members, p6

¹⁰⁹ Ibid

¹¹⁰ Who’s Who 1908-1926, the details of this are not available in the sources I have consulted

¹¹¹ NASA MHG 72998

¹¹² Who’s Who 1908-1929

¹¹³ TSA Register of Member 1, p8

the Randfontein Group of Mines before opening his own accounting practice in 1903.¹¹⁴ Muir was a member of the Provision Council of the TSA in 1904. He remained a member until 1911. He served as Vice-President of the Society in 1910. In 1937 Muir resigned his membership of the TSA when he retired.¹¹⁵

Frank Raleigh was born in England in 1863.¹¹⁶ Raleigh was a Fellow of Antiquaries and Accountants¹¹⁷ and practiced as a Director of Companies in the Johannesburg, residing on Jubilee Road in Parktown.¹¹⁸ He was one of the founding members of the IAASAR in 1894¹¹⁹ and was a member of its council in 1889¹²⁰, 1899¹²¹ and 1902.¹²² He was also a member of the Transvaal Branch of the British Society. His commitment to the development of the profession in South Africa was further evident when Raleigh was elected onto the Provisional Council of the TSA in 1904¹²³ and to the TSA Council in 1908.¹²⁴

Another Scot to influence the profession development was Charles Stuart. Born in Melrose, Scotland in 1865¹²⁵ he trained to become a Chartered Accountant belonging to the Institute of Accountants in England and Wales. Arriving in Johannesburg in 1896, he became Secretary to all the subsidiary companies of Consolidated Gold Fields of South Africa. Stuart was a member of the New and Country Clubs of Johannesburg and resided in the affluent suburb of Parktown. Stuart was a partner with Thomas Jon Ball in their firm Ball & Stuart, Accountants¹²⁶ and one of the founding council members of the TSA in 1904.¹²⁷ He remained on the Council until 1911. During that period he was elected Vice-President in 1907 and President in 1908.¹²⁸

Chartered Accountant and share broker, Samuel Thomson was born and educated in Glasgow. He arrived in Johannesburg in 1889, and was soon elected the chairman of the Stock Exchange as partner in what appears to be a share brokering company Kirkwood & Thomson. Their offices were in the Stock Exchange Buildings of the growing city. He was a

¹¹⁴ Who's Who 1908-1933

¹¹⁵ TSA Register of Members 1, p 8

¹¹⁶ NASA, MHG 97680

¹¹⁷ IAASAR Annul Report & Accounts, 1898

¹¹⁸ NASA, MHG 97680

¹¹⁹ IAASAR Articles of Association & Bye-Laws, 1894

¹²⁰ IAASAR Annual Report & Accounts, 1998

¹²¹ IAASAR Annual Report & Accounts, 1899

¹²² IAASAR Annual Report & Accounts, 1902

¹²³ TSA Register of Members , p9; TSA Year Book, 1905

¹²⁴ TSA Year Book, 1908

¹²⁵ NASA MHG 49221; Who's Who 1908 – 1922

¹²⁶ Who's Who 1908-1922

¹²⁷ TSA Register of members, p 10; TSA Year Book 1905; Who's Who 1908-1922

¹²⁸ TSA Register of Members, p10; TSA Year Books, 1905, 1908, 1909, 19010,1911; TSA AGM 1906, 1907

member of the Rand Club, and Past Chief of the Caledonian Society. He played an important role in the incorporation of the TSA¹²⁹ and was appointed as a Member of the Provisional Council in 1904. He was the Chairman of the first meeting of this Provincial Council in September 1904. Strongly involved in the Society, Thomson served on the Council for the years 1904-1924. He was elected Vice-President in the years 1905, 1910, 1917, and 1922 and was President of the Society in 1906 and 1911.¹³⁰

Thomas Watson, born in Lanarkshire, Scotland in 1860, trained in Glasgow in Law and Accounting before travelling to Natal, the USA, Australia, the East Indies and Japan where he gained experience as an accountants and businessman. He settled in Johannesburg where he practiced as a Public Accountant¹³¹ till his death at the age of fifty-two.¹³² Watson was elected to the TSA Provisional Council in 1904.

The last member of the TSA's 1904 Provisional Council was James A Boyd. He does not appear on any membership lists of the earlier organisations, and only on the Provisional Council of the TSA. Boyd was removed from the Register by the Council because of non-payment firstly in 1906 and then permanently in 1916.¹³³

There were also a number of TSA Presidents who served the accounting profession during the formative years. From another part of the Empire; Alfred Edward Andrew Williamson born in Ballarat, Victoria in Australia; came to Johannesburg in 1896. He was a Fellow of the Institute of Accountants in Victoria and an Accountant and Director of Companies,¹³⁴ Williamson soon became involved in the accounting profession in the Transvaal and joined the TSA in 1904. He was a member of the Council in 1906-1909 and 1912-1915 and was elected President in 1909.¹³⁵ As with the above mentioned accountants in the Transvaal society, Williamson too was a member of the prestigious Rand Club of Johannesburg.¹³⁶

Another member of the Johannesburg Rand Club was Percival Whiteley of Kent, England. He was born in 1876 and came to the Transvaal in 1899. A qualified Chartered Accountant he was an Associate of the Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales and as a Fellow of the Society of Accountants and Auditors. When he arrived in Johannesburg his

¹²⁹ TSA Register of Members, p 11; TSA Year Book 1905; Who's Who 1908- 1951;

¹³⁰ TSA Register of Members, 11; TSA Year Book 1905, 1908, 1911, 1912, 1915, 1917; TSA AGM 1906; van Rensburg, p iv

¹³¹ Who's Who 1908-1912

¹³² TSA Register of Members, p12; TSA Year Book 1905;

¹³³ TSA Register of Members, p4

¹³⁴ Who's Who 1908-1934

¹³⁵ TSA Register of Members, p 260; TSA Year Book 1908; TSA Proceedings of AGM 1906

¹³⁶ Who's Who 1908-1934

membership transferred to the Transvaal Branch.¹³⁷ He became a member of the TSA in 1904¹³⁸ and was elected to the Council in 1910,¹³⁹ 1914-1917¹⁴⁰ and 1922-1924¹⁴¹. He was elected Vice-President in 1911 and President of the TSA in 1912.¹⁴²

Born in Lockerbie in Dumfries Scotland; Somerville Craig Carruthers qualified as a Chartered Accountants in Glasgow. He arrived in Johannesburg in 1902 and immediately became a part of the society, participating as a member of the Rand Club and Caledonian Society. He joined the TSA when it was incorporated in 1904. He contributed greatly to the Society by being elected a member of the Council from 1906-1910 and 1912-1922¹⁴³ and 1925¹⁴⁴ and he was elected as Vice-President in 1909 and 1921 and President in 1913 and 1917.¹⁴⁵

Arthur N Smith graduated with a Bachelor of Arts in London before qualifying as a Chartered Accountant, becoming an Associate Member of the Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales. He was the resident partner in South Africa for Deloitte, Dever, Griffiths, Annan & Co and he practiced as a Chartered Accountant in London, New York, Cincinnati, Mexico, Johannesburg and Bulawayo.¹⁴⁶ As a member of the TSA, he was elected onto the Council in 1911, 1917 and 1918 and President in 1914.¹⁴⁷

Born in Bedfordshire; England Ernst Heirich Dankwerts came to the Transvaal in 1887 and served during the Anglo Boer War with the Cape Garrison Artillery. A keen outdoorsman Dankwerts was a member of the Transvaal Trout Acclimatisation Society and the prestigious Rand Club. As an Incorporated Accountant in England, he seemed to be drawn to the developing profession in the Transvaal and became a member of the Accountants and Auditors' Transvaal Branch¹⁴⁸ and later a member of the TSA where he became a Council member in 1911, 1912 and 1916-1920 and President of the Society in 1915.¹⁴⁹

Harold John Macrae was born in India in 1860 and attended the Royal Naval School in London. He qualified as an Incorporated Accountant after which he came to South Africa in

¹³⁷ The Society of Accountants and Auditors – Transvaal Branch Annual Report and Accounts 1906

¹³⁸ TSA Register of Members, p110; TSA Year Book 1905

¹³⁹ TSA Register of Members, p110; TSA Year Book 1911

¹⁴⁰ TSA Register of Members, p 110; TSA Year Book 1915, 1916, 1917

¹⁴¹ TSA Register of Members, p110;

¹⁴² TSA Register of members, p110; TSA Year Book 1911, 1912

¹⁴³ TSA Register of Members, p38; TSA Year Book 1908, 1911, 1912, 1915, 1916, 1917 & 1918

¹⁴⁴ TSA Minute Book June 1922-July 1926

¹⁴⁵ TSA Register of Members, p 38; TSA Year Book 1909, 1921, 1913, 1917

¹⁴⁶ Who's Who 1908

¹⁴⁷ TSA Year Book, 1911, 1914, 1915, 1917 & 1918

¹⁴⁸ SAA, Transvaal Branch, 1906.

¹⁴⁹ TSA Register of Members, p 160; TSA Year Book, 1911, 1912, 1916, 1917, 1918, 1919, 1920

1884. He resided in Parkview, Johannesburg and became a member of the Rand Club¹⁵⁰ and participated as an active Accountant in the move to incorporation. Macrae took up membership of the IAASAR in the year it was formed¹⁵¹ and served on its Council in 1897,¹⁵² 1898¹⁵³ and 1902.¹⁵⁴ He also joined the Society of Accountants and Auditors' Transvaal Branch¹⁵⁵ before taking up membership of the TSA from 1904 until his death in 1939¹⁵⁶. Macrae served on the TSA Council in 1910, 1915-1918¹⁵⁷ and was elected as Vice President in 1912 and 1915¹⁵⁸ and President in 1916.¹⁵⁹

Another local lad James Tesselar Goldsbury, was born in Knysna in the Cape Colony in 1867. Goldsbury, as the more adventurous Andersson who came from in Cape Town, took part in the first expedition to Mashonaland in 1890 and spent two years in the British South Africa Company's Police force. He was a member of the Johannesburg Rand Club when he moved to the city and worked as Manager of the Johannesburg Board of Executors & Trust Company Ltd.¹⁶⁰ Goldsbury's training in Accounting is not clear, but his interest in the accounting profession is apparent in his membership as Fellow of the Society of Antiquaries and Accountants¹⁶¹ as well as a Council member of the Society of Accountants & Auditors' Transvaal Branch.¹⁶² He joined the TSA in 1904 and was a member of the Council in 1912-1915, 1915-1919 and 1920-1923¹⁶³, and was elected Vice-President in 1913 and 1921¹⁶⁴ and President in 1918.¹⁶⁵

The final individual discussed is the only individual not born in Britain or within the British Empire: Harry G.L. Panchaud. Panchaud was born in Naples, Italy, in 1865 and educated privately in England and then attended the Military College in Switzerland. After spending 15 years in Calcutta he came to South Africa in 1899 as an Officer in the Calcutta Light Horse Brigade where he spent two years in active service in Ladysmith. He was a Captain of the Town Squadron LLH; Honourable Secretary of the Transvaal Branch of the Navy League and member of the Rand and Athenaeum Clubs in Johannesburg. Panchaud qualified as an

¹⁵⁰ Who's Who 1908- 1939

¹⁵¹ IAASAR Articles of Association & Bye-Laws, 1894

¹⁵² IAASAR Annual Reports and Accounts, 1898

¹⁵³ IAASAR Annual Reports and Accounts, 1899

¹⁵⁴ IAASAR Annual report and Accounts, 1902

¹⁵⁵ SAA, Transvaal Branch, Annual Report and Accounts, 1906

¹⁵⁶ TSA Register of Members, p 306

¹⁵⁷ TSA Register of Members, p 306; TSA Year Book 1911, 1915, 1916, 1917

¹⁵⁸ TSA Year Book 1915

¹⁵⁹ TSA year Book 1915

¹⁶⁰ Who's Who 1908- 1940

¹⁶¹ TSA Register of Members, p 103

¹⁶² SAA, Transvaal Branch, Annual Report & Accounts, 1906

¹⁶³ TSA Register of Members, p 103; TSA Year Book, 1912, 1916, 1917, 1918, 1920 & 1921

¹⁶⁴ TSA Register of Members, P 103; TSA Year Book 1913 & 1921

¹⁶⁵ TSA Register of Members, p 103; TSA Year Book, 1918

Incorporated Accountant in England and was a fellow of the FSAA.¹⁶⁶ In 1902, he became a member of the IAASAR¹⁶⁷ as well as the Society's Transvaal Branch.¹⁶⁸ Panchaud became a member of the TSA in 1904¹⁶⁹ and a member of the Council in 1907-1909, 1913-1916 and 1918-1920, 1924 & 1925,¹⁷⁰ Vice-President in 1909¹⁷¹ and President in 1919 and 1920.¹⁷²

The leading members of the TSA during the formative years contributed in a major way to the broader society, business and economic development of the Transvaal. Reliable financial statements were instrumental in attracting investment and professional management to the Transvaal. The standing of accountants enhanced the attractiveness of business enterprise and growing business interest constitutes the wheels of a new economy. The professional knowledge of accountants was applied in private business activities, in the banking and other financial services enterprises and in government administration. Professional accountants often also ventured into business themselves and as business managers, they made a vital contribution to sound business practice and governance in the Transvaal. These accountants also made an important contribution to the mining industry by disseminating their accounting and management expertise to the new industry. The engagement with the TCOA is an example of this. As well respected wealthy members of society, they established a class network in social clubs, but also engaged in civil society to build an environment conducive to business and economic progress. These accountants came from predominantly middle class roots, but insisted on incorporation of the TSA as prerequisite to professional closure. By that time, the SAA had not succeeded in gaining such statutory recognition in Britain. SAA members in the Transvaal therefore championed strongly for such recognition. With professional closure, professional practicing rights would be secured and it was expected that status would lead to professional security. The accountants' actions implied that the market for accountants' professional services needed to be self-regulated. This would in future lead to contestation with accounting organisations in the mother country.

¹⁶⁶ Who's Who 1908-1927

¹⁶⁷ IAASAR, Annual Report and Accounts, 1902

¹⁶⁸ SAA, Transvaal Branch, Annual Report & Accounts, 1906

¹⁶⁹ TSA Register of Members, p 108; TSA Year Book 1907, 1908, 1909

¹⁷⁰ TSA Register of Members, p 109; TSA Year Book 1907, 1908, 1909, 1913, 1914, 1915, 1916, 1918, 1919, 1920, 1924, 1925

¹⁷¹ TSA Register of Members 1909; TSA Year Book, 1909

¹⁷² TSA Register of Members 1919 & 1920

Conclusion

The British accounting organisations in the Transvaal emerged as a result of economic development around the mining industry but the characteristics of those organisations were indistinguishable from those in Britain. This shows that they were merely extensions of the Imperial nature, values, social culture and business environment.

In understanding the accounting professionalization process in the Transvaal Colony, the analysis of the individuals demonstrates the conduct of the profession. Although the qualities of accountants in the Transvaal Colony emerged from their social and professional making in Britain, accountants in the Transvaal Colony were carving out for themselves a domain of professional practice, which was the typical conduct of professionals.

Seven characteristics have been identified amongst the Scottish and English accountants that could be traced amongst the leaders of the TSA. The men were born into middle or upper working class families, which were involved in trade, for instance George Watson and Howard Pims families were merchants, and Robert Baikie's father was an architect. This more affluent background furnished them with better education opportunities facilitating their qualification as accountants. Religion appears to be another important factor contributing to the success of the individuals. George Watson was Treasurer for the Society for the Propagation of Christian Knowledge, which was based on his Christian beliefs. Howard Pim was a Quaker, this foundation was apparent in the way he conducted his business, contributed to the establishment of the TSA and respected in society.

All the accountants mentioned in the Transvaal were businessmen renowned for good business, thus making a profound contribution to their own accounting firms and in related businesses, to the economy. Some of the accounting firms merged into the internationally renowned Deloitte and Tomahasu firm and KPMG. In many cases the individuals extended their spheres of influence from business into political activities. James Ewing was a member of Parliament amongst other political roles, Howard Pim was deputy mayor and served on the first Town council of Johannesburg. Aiken served as town treasurer of Johannesburg and served on the boards of several private companies in Johannesburg. These accountants engaged directly with the civil environment, the city of Johannesburg and the new British colonial government.

Social engagement was found to be important to all the individuals discussed as they belonged to clubs, founded clubs, supported sporting and cultural endeavours and showed

benevolence to the societies in which they lived. Their contributions were recognised and in some cases, were honoured with awards of Justice of Peace, Officer of the British Empire and even a Knighthood. The accountants developed a profile of trust and responsibility which entrusted them with a broader social leadership role.

From the analysis of the characteristics of the organisation's leaders, common elements were traced back to the men in Scotland and England who were the pioneers of the profession. Common characteristics were identified among the individuals discussed in this paper leading to the conclusion that the men that made the TSA held similar qualities to those in Scotland. This demonstrates qualities true to the leaders in the accounting profession.

The professional development in the British colonies or the periphery of the British Commonwealth, happened under different political and economic circumstance to that in Britain. The Institute's overseas policy regarding practicing accountants in the Commonwealth pushed the accountants in the Transvaal Colony to seek recognition from the local government. The incorporation of the TSA in 1904 allowed for the continuity of the professional activities from Britain in the Colony but under its own organisation. The SAA was more active in pursuing a domain for its members in the Commonwealth than the ICAEW. Professional contestation in Britain was therefore transferred into the periphery, in this case the Transvaal. The 'Battle of the British' slowly emerged in the accountancy arena of the Commonwealth and facilitated the gradual emergence of an accounting identity unique to the Transvaal Colony.

List of Sources

Primary Sources

Cunningham, A. (1976): *Pim Collection* in the Historical Papers of the William Cullen Library at the University of Johannesburg

Institute of Accountants and Auditors in the South African Republic: Articles of Association and By-Laws (1894)

Institute of Accountants and Auditors in the South African Republic: Annual Report and Accounts (1894)

Institute of Accountants and Auditors in the South African Republic: Annual Report and Accounts (1898)

Institute of Accountants and Auditors in the South African Republic: Annual Report and Accounts (1899)

Institute of Accountants and Auditors in the South African Republic: Annual Report and Accounts (1902)

National Archive of South Africa, Pretoria; ENTd F52/311; Robert Baikie

National Archives of South Africa, Pretoria; LD 528 AG4042/3; Letter from J.H. Pim to Sir Richard Solomon, 27 November 1903.

National Archives of South Africa, Pretoria; Master of Supreme Court (MGH) 2838/41 A. Aiken

National Archives of South Africa, Pretoria; Master of Supreme Court (MGH) 88635: Estate of Late R. Baikie

National Archives of South Africa, Pretoria; Master of Supreme Court (MGH) 84939: Estate of Late J.H. Pim

National Archives of South Africa, Pretoria; Master of Supreme Court (MGH) 60083: Estate of Late J. Dougall

National Archive of South Africa, Pretoria; Master of Supreme Court (MGH) 72998: Estate of Late F. Lynch

National Archive of South Africa, Pretoria; Master of Supreme Court (MHG) 97680: Estate of Late F. Raleigh

National Archives of South Africa, Pretoria, (Court Records) WLD 5/16 286/ 1903: Insolvency of Pim / Douglas Partnership

Ordinances of the Transvaal, 1904. Park IL, Nos. 18 to 50 and I to V (Private); No 3 of 1904 (Private) Pretoria

Sanlam Life Insurers, Annual Reports, 1920, 1921, 1923, 1924, 1925, 1926 & 1927

The Society of Accountants and Auditors and the Institute of Accountants and Auditors in the South African Republic; Deed of Agreement: Johannesburg 1902

The Society of Accountants and Auditors (Transvaal Branch); Annual Report and Accounts; 1906

The Transvaal Society of Accountants, Minute Book June 1922 - July 1926

The Transvaal Society of Accountants; Register of Members 1, 15 August 1904-15 February 1905

The Transvaal Society of Accountants, Report of the Council and Balance Sheet, 1906, 1907, 1913

The Transvaal Society of Accountants, Year Books, 1905, 1908, 1911, 1912, 1915, 1916, 1917, 1918, 1920, 1921

Secondary Sources

Andrews, T.E. (1999) *Ten Walking Tours Through Pretoria's Historical Past*; <http://www.emagameni.co.za/10%20Walking%20Tours%20Through%20Pretorias%20Historical%20Past.pdf> (Accessed 18 May 2011)

Brown, R. (1968): *A History of Accounting and Accountants*, Frank Cass & Co. Ltd: London

Burnett, D.J. (1990): *J. Howard Pim (1862-1934): An Examination of his Liberal Philosophy and Educational Activities*, (Unpublished)

Chua, W.F. and Poullaos, C. (2002): "The Empire Strikes Back? An exploration of centre-periphery interaction between the ICAEW and accounting associations in the self-governing colonies of Australia, Canada and South Africa, 1880-1907" in *Accounting, Organizations and Society, Vol. 27*

Cunningham, A. (1987): *Howard Pim No 20*, Parktown and Westcliffe Heritage Trust

Cunningham, A. (1987): *Sir Llewellyn Andersson* No 5, Johannesburg Historical Foundation for the Parktown and Westcliff Heritage Trust

De Kock, W.J. (1968): *Dictionary of South African Biography*; National Council of Social Research: Cape Town

Deloitte Southern Africa (2006): “Of Ledgers and Legends – The Story of Deloitte Southern Africa”

Kirkwall Grammar School: <http://www.kgs.orkney.sch.uk/about/history.htm> (accessed 17 May 2011)

KPMG, History <http://www.kpmg.com/za/en/howeare/about/history/Pages/default.aspx> (accessed 18 May 2011)

Lee, T.A. (2004): “Economic Class, Social Straus and Early Scottish Chartered Accountants” in *Accounting Historians Journal*, Vol. 31(2)

Morris, R.J. (1993): “Clubs, Societies and Association” in F.M.L. Thompson (Ed): *The Cambridge Social History of Britain 1750-1950 Vol. 3: Social Agencies and Institutions*; Cambridge University Press: Cambridge

Noyce, G.E. (1954): “The History of Profession in South Africa” in *Die Suid-Afrikaanse Rekenmeester*

Poullaos, C. (2009): “Professionalization” in *The Rutledge Companion to Accountancy History*, JR Edwards and SP Walker (Eds): Oxford.

Putnam, R.D. (1990): “Making Democracy Work: Civic Traditions in Modern Italy” Princeton University Press: Princeton, NJ. Cited in Stolle (1998): “Bowling Together,

Bowling Alone: The Development of Voluntary Trust in Voluntary Associations” in *Political Psychology*, Vol. 19 (3)

Sian, S and Poullaos, C. (2010): “Setting the Stage” in Accountancy and Empire: The British Legacy of Professional Organisation” C. Poullaos and S. Sian (Eds), Routledge: New York.

South African Who’s Who, Social and Business, Ken. Donaldson: London (various years)

Stacey, N.A.H. (1954): *English Accountancy*, Gee & Co. Ltd: London

Van Rensburg, M.J.J. (1990) *Presidents I have known: Some aspects of the history of the Transvaal Society of Chartered Accountants*, Transvaal Society of Chartered Accountants Integritas: Johannesburg

Verhoef, G. & Van Vuuren, L.; (2009): *The Year the Century Ended: The Genesis of the Transvaal Society of Accountants*; Unpublished paper presented at the Economic Society of Southern Africa Conference in September 2009

Walker, S.P. (2002): ““Men of Small Standing’? Locating Accountants in English Society during the Mid-Nineteenth Century” in *The European Accounting Review*, Vol. 11 (2)